#### 103D CONGRESS 2D SESSION

# H. R. 4035

To establish constitutional procedures for the imposition of the death penalty.

#### IN THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

MARCH 15, 1994

Mr. Edwards of California (for himself and Mr. Schumer) introduced the following bill; which was referred to the Committee on the Judiciary

## A BILL

To establish constitutional procedures for the imposition of the death penalty.

- 1 Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-
- 2 tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,
- 3 SECTION 1. CONSTITUTIONAL PROCEDURES FOR THE IM-
- 4 POSITION OF THE SENTENCE OF DEATH.
- 5 Part II of title 18 of the United States Code is
- 6 amended by adding the following new chapter after chap-
- 7 ter 227:

#### 8 "CHAPTER 228—DEATH SENTENCE

<sup>&</sup>quot;Sec.

<sup>&</sup>quot;3591. Sentence of death.

<sup>&</sup>quot;3592. Mitigating and aggravating factors to be considered in determining whether a sentence of death is justified.

<sup>&</sup>quot;3593. Special hearing to determine whether a sentence of death is justified.

<sup>&</sup>quot;3594. Imposition of a sentence of death.

"3595. Review of a sentence of death.

"3596. Implementation of a sentence of death.

"3597. Use of State facilities.

"3598. Special provisions for Indian country.

#### 1 "§ 3591. Sentence of death

"A defendant who has been found guilty of— 2 "(1) an offense described in section 794 or sec-3 tion 2381 of this title; or 4 "(2) any other offense for which a sentence of 5 death is provided, if the defendant, as determined 6 beyond a reasonable doubt at the hearing under sec-7 8 tion 3593— 9 "(A) intentionally killed the victim; "(B) intentionally inflicted serious bodily 10 11 injury that resulted in the death of the victim; "(C) intentionally participated in an act, 12 contemplating that the life of a person would be 13 14 taken or intending that lethal force would be 15 used in connection with a person, other than 16 one of the participants in the offense, and the victim died as a direct result of the act; or 17 "(D) intentionally and specifically engaged 18 in an act of violence, knowing that the act cre-19 20 ated a grave risk of death to a person, other 21 than one of the participants in the offense, such 22 that participation in the act constituted a reck-

1	less disregard for human life and the victim
2	died as a direct result of the act,
3	shall be sentenced to death if, after consideration of the
4	factors set forth in section 3592 in the course of a hearing
5	held pursuant to section 3593, it is determined that impo-
6	sition of a sentence of death is justified, except that no
7	person may be sentenced to death who was less than 18
8	years of age at the time of the offense.
9	"§ 3592. Mitigating and aggravating factors to be con-
10	sidered in determining whether a sen-
11	tence of death is justified
12	"(a) MITIGATING FACTORS.—In determining wheth-
13	er a sentence of death is to be imposed on a defendant,
14	the finder of fact shall consider any mitigating factor, in-
15	cluding the following:
16	"(1) Impaired capacity.—The defendant's ca-
17	pacity to appreciate the wrongfulness of the defend-
18	ant's conduct or to conform conduct to the require-
19	ments of law was significantly impaired, regardless
20	of whether the capacity was so impaired as to con-
21	stitute a defense to the charge.
22	"(2) Duress.—The defendant was under un-
23	usual and substantial duress, regardless of whether
24	the duress was of such a degree as to constitute a
25	defense to the charge.

- "(3) MINOR PARTICIPATION.—The defendant is punishable as a principal (as defined in section 2 of title 18 of the United States Code) in the offense, which was committed by another, but the defendant's participation was relatively minor, regardless of whether the participation was so minor as to constitute a defense to the charge.
  - "(4) EQUALLY CULPABLE DEFENDANTS.—Another defendant or defendants, equally culpable in the crime, will not be punished by death.
    - "(5) NO PRIOR CRIMINAL RECORD.—The defendant did not have a significant prior history of other criminal conduct.
    - "(6) DISTURBANCE.—The defendant committed the offense under severe mental or emotional disturbance.
  - "(7) VICTIM'S CONSENT.—The victim consented to the criminal conduct that resulted in the victim's death.
- 20 "(8) OTHER FACTORS.—Other factors in the 21 defendant's background, record, or character or any 22 other circumstance of the offense that mitigate 23 against imposition of the death sentence.
- 24 "(b) AGGRAVATING FACTORS FOR ESPIONAGE AND 25 TREASON.—In determining whether a sentence of death

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

- 1 is justified for an offense described in section 3591(1), the
- 2 jury, or if there is no jury, the court, shall consider each
- 3 of the following aggravating factors for which notice has
- 4 been given and determine which, if any, exist:
- 5 "(1) Prior espionage or treason of-
- 6 FENSE.—The defendant has previously been con-
- 7 victed of another offense involving espionage or trea-
- 8 son for which a sentence of either life imprisonment
- 9 or death was authorized by law.
- 10 "(2) Grave risk to national security.—In
- the commission of the offense the defendant know-
- ingly created a grave risk of substantial danger to
- the national security.
- 14 "(3) Grave risk of Death.—In the commis-
- sion of the offense the defendant knowingly created
- a grave risk of death to another person.
- 17 The jury, or if there is no jury, the court, may consider
- 18 whether any other aggravating factor for which notice has
- 19 been given exists.
- 20 "(c) Aggravating Factors for Homicide.—In
- 21 determining whether a sentence of death is justified for
- 22 an offense described in section 3591(2), the jury, or if
- 23 there is no jury, the court, shall consider each of the fol-
- 24 lowing aggravating factors for which notice has been given
- 25 and determine which, if any, exist:

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

"(1) DEATH DURING COMMISSION OF ANOTHER CRIME.—The death, or injury resulting in death, occurred during the commission or attempted commission of, or during the immediate flight from the commission of, an offense under section 32 (destruction of aircraft or aircraft facilities), section 33 (destruction of motor vehicles or motor vehicle facilities), section 36 (violence at international airports), section 351 (violence against Members of Congress, Cabinet officers, or Supreme Court Justices), an offense under section 751 (prisoners in custody of institution or officer), section 794 (gathering or delivering defense information to aid foreign government), section 844(d) (transportation of explosives in interstate commerce for certain purposes), section 844(f) (destruction of Government property by explosives), section 1118 (prisoners serving life term), section 1201 (kidnapping), section 844(i) (destruction of property affecting interstate commerce by explosives), section 1116 (killing or attempted killing of diplomats), section 1203 (hostage taking), section 1992 (wrecking trains), section 2280 (maritime violence), section 2281 (maritime platform violence), section 2332 (terrorist acts abroad against United States nationals), section 2339 (use of weapons of

- mass destruction), or section 2381 (treason) of this title, or section 902 (i) or (n) of the Federal Aviation Act of 1958 (49 U.S.C. 1472 (i) or (n)) (aircraft piracy).
  - "(2) Previous conviction of violent felony involving firearm.—For any offense, other
    than an offense for which a sentence of death is
    sought on the basis of section 924(c) of this title, as
    amended by this Act, the defendant has previously
    been convicted of a Federal or State offense punishable by a term of imprisonment of more than one
    year, involving the use or attempted or threatened
    use of a firearm, as defined in section 921 of this
    title, against another person.
    - "(3) Previous conviction of offense for Which a sentence of death or life imprisonment was authorized.—The defendant has previously been convicted of another Federal or State offense resulting in the death of a person, for which a sentence of life imprisonment or a sentence of death was authorized by statute.
    - "(4) Previous conviction of other serious offenses.—The defendant has previously been convicted of two or more Federal or State offenses, punishable by a term of imprisonment of more than

- one year, committed on different occasions, involving the infliction of, or attempted infliction of, serious bodily injury or death upon another person.
  - "(5) Grave RISK of DEATH TO ADDITIONAL PERSONS.—The defendant, in the commission of the offense, or in escaping apprehension for the violation of the offense, knowingly created a grave risk of death to one or more persons in addition to the victim of the offense.
    - "(6) Heinous, Cruel, or Depraved Manner of Committing Offense.—The defendant committed the offense in an especially heinous, cruel, or depraved manner in that it involved torture or serious physical abuse to the victim.
    - "(7) PROCUREMENT OF OFFENSE BY PAY-MENT.—The defendant procured the commission of the offense by payment, or promise of payment, of anything of pecuniary value.
    - "(8) PECUNIARY GAIN.—The defendant committed the offense as consideration for the receipt, or in the expectation of the receipt, of anything of pecuniary value.
  - "(9) SUBSTANTIAL PLANNING AND PREMEDITATION.—The defendant committed the offense after substantial planning and premeditation

- to cause the death of a person or commit an act of terrorism.
- "(10) CONVICTION FOR TWO FELONY DRUG OF-FENSES.—The defendant has previously been convicted of two or more State or Federal offenses punishable by a term of imprisonment of more than one year, committed on different occasions, involving the distribution of a controlled substance.
  - "(11) VULNERABILITY OF VICTIM.—The victim was particularly vulnerable due to old age, youth, or infirmity.
  - "(12) Conviction for Serious Federal Drug offenses.—The defendant had previously been convicted of violating title II or title III of the Controlled Substances Act for which a sentence of 5 or more years may be imposed or had previously been convicted of engaging in a continuing criminal enterprise.
  - "(13) CONTINUING CRIMINAL ENTERPRISE IN-VOLVING DRUG SALES TO MINORS.—The defendant committed the offense in the course of engaging in a continuing criminal enterprise in violation of section 408(c) of the Controlled Substances Act and that violation involved the distribution of drugs to

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

1	persons under the age of 21 in violation of section
2	418 of such Act.
3	"(14) High public officials.—The defend-
4	ant committed the offense against—
5	"(A) the President of the United States,
6	the President-elect, the Vice President, the
7	Vice-President-elect, the Vice-President-des-
8	ignate, or, if there is no Vice President, the of-
9	ficer next in order of succession to the office of
10	the President of the United States, or any per-
11	son who is acting as President under the Con-
12	stitution and laws of the United States;
13	"(B) a Chief of State, head of government,
14	or the political equivalent, of a foreign nation;
15	"(C) a foreign official listed in section
16	1116(b)(3)(A) of this title, if the official is in
17	the United States on official business; or
18	"(D) a Federal public servant who is a
19	judge, a law enforcement officer, or an em-
20	ployee of a United States penal or correctional
21	institution—
22	"(i) while he or she is engaged in the
23	performance of his or her official duties;
24	"(ii) because of the performance of his
25	or her official duties; or

1	"(iii) because of his or her status as
2	a public servant.
3	For purposes of this subparagraph, a 'law en-
4	forcement officer' is a public servant authorized
5	by law or by a Government agency or Congress
6	to conduct or engage in the prevention, inves-
7	tigation, or prosecution or adjudication of an
8	offense, and includes those engaged in correc-
9	tions, parole, or probation functions.
10	"(15) PRIOR CONVICTION OF SEXUAL ASSAULT
11	OR CHILD MOLESTATION.—In the case of an offense
12	under chapter 109A (sexual abuse) or chapter 110
13	(sexual abuse of children), the defendant has pre-
14	viously been convicted of a crime of sexual assault
15	or crime of child molestation.
16	The jury, or if there is no jury, the court, may consider
17	whether any other aggravating factor for which notice has
18	been given exists.
19	"§ 3593. Special hearing to determine whether a sen-
20	tence of death is justified
21	"(a) Notice by the Government.—If, in a case
22	involving an offense described in section 3591, the attor-
23	ney for the government believes that the circumstances of
24	the offense are such that a sentence of death is justified
25	under this chapter, the attorney shall, a reasonable time

- 1 before the trial or before acceptance by the court of a plea
- 2 of guilty, sign and file with the court, and serve on the
- 3 defendant, a notice—
- 4 "(1) stating that the government believes that
- 5 the circumstances of the offense are such that, if the
- 6 defendant is convicted, a sentence of death is justi-
- 7 fied under this chapter and that the government will
- 8 seek the sentence of death; and
- 9 "(2) setting forth the aggravating factor or fac-
- tors that the government, if the defendant is con-
- victed, proposes to prove as justifying a sentence of
- death.
- 13 The factors for which notice is provided under this sub-
- 14 section may include factors concerning the effect of the
- 15 offense on the victim and the victim's family, and may
- 16 include oral testimony, a victim impact statement that
- 17 identifies the victim of the offense and the extent and
- 18 scope of the injury and loss suffered by the victim and
- 19 the victim's family, and any other relevant information.
- 20 The court may permit the notice to include any aggravat-
- 21 ing factor that is not an element of the underlying offense.
- 22 The court may also permit the attorney for the govern-
- 23 ment to amend the notice upon a showing of good cause.
- 24 "(b) Hearing Before a Court or Jury.—If the
- 25 attorney for the government has filed a notice as required

1	under subsection (a) and the defendant is found guilty of
2	or pleads guilty to an offense described in section 3591,
3	the judge who presided at the trial or before whom the
4	guilty plea was entered, or another judge if that judge is
5	unavailable, shall conduct a separate sentencing hearing
6	to determine the punishment to be imposed. The hearing
7	shall be conducted—
8	"(1) before the jury that determined the de-
9	fendant's guilt;
10	"(2) before a jury impaneled for the purpose of
11	the hearing if—
12	"(A) the defendant was convicted upon a
13	plea of guilty;
14	"(B) the defendant was convicted after a
15	trial before the court sitting without a jury;
16	"(C) the jury that determined the defend-
17	ant's guilt was discharged for good cause; or
18	"(D) after initial imposition of a sentence
19	under this section, reconsideration of the sen-
20	tence under this section is necessary; or
21	"(3) before the court alone, upon the motion of
22	the defendant and with the approval of the attorney
23	for the government.
24	A jury impaneled pursuant to paragraph (2) shall consist
25	of 12 members, unless, at any time before the conclusion

- 1 of the hearing, the parties stipulate, with the approval of
- 2 the court, that it shall consist of a lesser number.
- 3 "(c) Proof of Mitigating and Aggravating Fac-
- 4 TORS.—Notwithstanding rule 32(c) of the Federal Rules
- 5 of Criminal Procedure, when a defendant is found guilty
- 6 or pleads guilty to an offense under section 3591, no
- 7 presentence report shall be prepared. At the sentencing
- 8 hearing, information may be presented as to any matter
- 9 relevant to the sentence, including any mitigating or ag-
- 10 gravating factor permitted or required to be considered
- 11 under section 3592. Information presented may include
- 12 the trial transcript and exhibits if the hearing is held be-
- 13 fore a jury or judge not present during the trial. The de-
- 14 fendant may present any information relevant to a miti-
- 15 gating factor. The government may present any informa-
- 16 tion relevant to an aggravating factor for which notice has
- 17 been provided under subsection (a). The government and
- 18 the defendant shall be permitted to rebut any information
- 19 received at the hearing, and shall be given fair opportunity
- 20 to present argument as to the adequacy of the information
- 21 to establish the existence of any aggravating or mitigating
- 22 factor, and as to the appropriateness in the case of impos-
- 23 ing a sentence of death. The government shall open the
- 24 argument. The defendant shall be permitted to reply. The
- 25 government shall then be permitted to reply in rebuttal.

- 1 The burden of establishing the existence of any aggravat-
- 2 ing factor is on the government, and is not satisfied unless
- 3 the existence of such a factor is established beyond a rea-
- 4 sonable doubt. The burden of establishing the existence
- 5 of any mitigating factor is on the defendant, and is not
- 6 satisfied unless the existence of such a factor is established
- 7 by a preponderance of the information.
- 8 "(d) RETURN OF SPECIAL FINDINGS.—The jury, or
- 9 if there is no jury, the court, shall consider all the informa-
- 10 tion received during the hearing. It shall return special
- 11 findings identifying any aggravating factor or factors set
- 12 forth in section 3592 found to exist and any other aggra-
- 13 vating factor for which notice has been provided under
- 14 subsection (a) found to exist. A finding with respect to
- 15 a mitigating factor may be made by 1 or more members
- 16 of the jury, and any member of the jury who finds the
- 17 existence of a mitigating factor may consider such factor
- 18 established for purposes of this section regardless of the
- 19 number of jurors who concur that the factor has been es-
- 20 tablished. A finding with respect to any aggravating factor
- 21 must be unanimous. If no aggravating factor set forth in
- 22 section 3592 is found to exist, the court shall impose a
- 23 sentence other than death authorized by law.
- 24 "(e) Return of a Finding Concerning a Sen-
- 25 TENCE OF DEATH.—If, in the case of—

- "(1) an offense described in section 3591(1), an aggravating factor required to be considered under section 3592(b) is found to exist; or
- "(2) an offense described in section 3591(2), an
  aggravating factor required to be considered under
  section 3592(c) is found to exist,
- 7 the jury, or if there is no jury, the court, shall consider
- 8 whether all the aggravating factor or factors found to exist
- 9 sufficiently outweigh all the mitigating factor or factors
- 10 found to exist to justify a sentence of death, or, in the
- 11 absence of a mitigating factor, whether the aggravating
- 12 factor or factors alone are sufficient to justify a sentence
- 13 of death. Based upon this consideration, the jury by unan-
- 14 imous vote, or if there is no jury, the court, shall rec-
- 15 ommend whether the defendant should be sentenced to
- 16 death, to life imprisonment without possibility of release,
- 17 or to some other lesser sentence. The jury or the court,
- 18 if there is no jury, regardless of its findings with respect
- 19 to aggravating and mitigating factors, is never required
- 20 to impose a death sentence and the jury shall be so in-
- 21 structed.
- 22 "(f) Special Precaution To Ensure Against
- 23 DISCRIMINATION.—In a hearing held before a jury, the
- 24 court, prior to the return of a finding under subsection
- 25 (e), shall instruct the jury that, in considering whether

- 1 a sentence of death is justified, it shall not consider the
- 2 race, color, religious beliefs, national origin, or sex of the
- 3 defendant or of any victim and that the jury is not to rec-
- 4 ommend a sentence of death unless it has concluded that
- 5 it would recommend a sentence of death for the crime in
- 6 question no matter what the race, color, religious beliefs,
- 7 national origin, or sex of the defendant or of any victim
- 8 may be. The jury, upon return of a finding under sub-
- 9 section (e), shall also return to the court a certificate,
- 10 signed by each juror, that consideration of the race, color,
- 11 religious beliefs, national origin, or sex of the defendant
- 12 or any victim was not involved in reaching his or her indi-
- 13 vidual decision and that the individual juror would have
- 14 made the same recommendation regarding a sentence for
- 15 the crime in question no matter what the race, color, reli-
- 16 gious beliefs, national origin, or sex of the defendant or
- 17 any victim may be.

## 18 "§ 3594. Imposition of a sentence of death

- "Upon a recommendation under section 3593(e) that
- 20 the defendant should be sentenced to death or life impris-
- 21 onment without possibility of release, the court shall sen-
- 22 tence the defendant accordingly. Otherwise, the court shall
- 23 impose any lesser sentence that is authorized by law. Not-
- 24 withstanding any other provision of law, if the maximum
- 25 term of imprisonment for the offense is life imprisonment,

the court may impose a sentence of life imprisonment without possibility of release. 3 "§ 3595. Review of a sentence of death "(a) APPEAL.—In a case in which a sentence of death 4 is imposed, the sentence shall be subject to review by the court of appeals upon appeal by the defendant. Notice of appeal must be filed within the time specified for the filing of a notice of appeal. An appeal under this section may 8 be consolidated with an appeal of the judgment of conviction and shall have priority over all other cases. 10 "(b) Review.—The court of appeals shall review the 11 entire record in the case, including— "(1) the evidence submitted during the trial; 13 "(2) the information submitted during the sen-14 15 tencing hearing; "(3) the procedures employed in the sentencing 16 17 hearing; and 18 "(4) the special findings returned under section 19 3593(d). "(c) DECISION AND DISPOSITION.— 20 "(1) The court of appeals shall address all sub-21 22 stantive and procedural issues raised on the appeal of a sentence of death, and shall consider whether 23

the sentence of death was imposed under the influ-

ence of passion, prejudice, or any other arbitrary

24

1	factor and whether the evidence supports the special
2	finding of the existence of an aggravating factor re-
3	quired to be considered under section 3592.
4	"(2) Whenever the court of appeals finds
5	that—
6	"(A) the sentence of death was imposed
7	under the influence of passion, prejudice, or any
8	other arbitrary factor;
9	"(B) the admissible evidence and informa-
10	tion adduced does not support the special find-
11	ing of the existence of the required aggravating
12	factor; or
13	"(C) the proceedings involved any other
14	legal error requiring reversal of the sentence
15	that was properly preserved for appeal under
16	the rules of criminal procedure,
17	the court shall remand the case for reconsideration
18	under section 3593 or imposition of a sentence other
19	than death.
20	"(3) The court of appeals shall state in writing
21	the reasons for its disposition of an appeal of a sen-
22	tence of death under this section.
23	"§ 3596. Implementation of a sentence of death
24	"(a) In General.—A person who has been sen-
25	tenced to death pursuant to the provisions of this chapter

- 1 shall be committed to the custody of the Attorney General
- 2 until exhaustion of the procedures for appeal of the judg-
- 3 ment of conviction and for review of the sentence. When
- 4 the sentence is to be implemented, the Attorney General
- 5 shall release the person sentenced to death to the custody
- 6 of a United States marshal, who shall supervise implemen-
- 7 tation of the sentence in the manner prescribed by the law
- 8 of the State in which the sentence is imposed. If the law
- 9 of such State does not provide for implementation of a
- 10 sentence of death, the court shall designate another State,
- 11 the law of which does provide for the implementation of
- 12 a sentence of death, and the sentence shall be implemented
- 13 in the latter State in the manner prescribed by such law.
- 14 "(b) Pregnant Woman.—A sentence of death shall
- 15 not be carried out upon a woman while she is pregnant.
- 16 "(c) Mental Capacity.—A sentence of death shall
- 17 not be carried out upon a person who is mentally retarded.
- 18 A sentence of death shall not be carried out upon a person
- 19 who, as a result of mental disability, lacks the mental ca-
- 20 pacity to understand the death penalty and why it was
- 21 imposed on that person.

### 22 **"§ 3597. Use of State facilities**

- 23 "(a) IN GENERAL.—A United States marshal
- 24 charged with supervising the implementation of a sentence
- 25 of death may use appropriate State or local facilities for

- 1 the purpose, may use the services of an appropriate State
- 2 or local official or of a person such an official employs
- 3 for the purpose, and shall pay the costs thereof in an
- 4 amount approved by the Attorney General.
- 5 "(b) Excuse of an Employee on Moral or Reli-
- 6 GIOUS GROUNDS.—No employee of any State department
- 7 of corrections, the United States Department of Justice,
- 8 the Federal Bureau of Prisons, or the United States Mar-
- 9 shals Service, and no employee providing services to that
- 10 department, bureau, or service under contract shall be re-
- 11 quired, as a condition of that employment or contractual
- 12 obligation, to be in attendance at or to participate in any
- 13 prosecution or execution under this section if such partici-
- 14 pation is contrary to the moral or religious convictions of
- 15 the employee. For purposes of this subsection, the term
- 16 'participation' includes personal preparation of the con-
- 17 demned individual and the apparatus used for execution
- 18 and supervision of the activities of other personnel in car-
- 19 rying out such activities.

## 20 "§ 3598. Special provisions for Indian country

- 21 "Notwithstanding sections 1152 and 1153, no person
- 22 subject to the criminal jurisdiction of an Indian tribal gov-
- 23 ernment shall be subject to a capital sentence under this
- 24 chapter for any offense the Federal jurisdiction for which
- 25 is predicated solely on Indian country as defined in section

- 1 1151 of this title, and which has occurred within the
- 2 boundaries of such Indian country, unless the governing
- 3 body of the tribe has elected that this chapter have effect
- 4 over land and persons subject to its criminal jurisdiction.".
- 5 (b) AMENDMENT OF CHAPTER ANALYSIS.—The
- 6 chapter analysis of part II of title 18, United States Code,
- 7 is amended by adding the following new item after the
- 8 item relating to chapter 227:

 $\bigcirc$ 

HR 4035 IH——2